



Islamika Granada

Available online <https://penelitimuda.com/index.php/IG/index>

Kritik Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi Terhadap Liberalisme

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi' Critics Toward Liberalism

Jefry Anggara^(1*) & Mohammad Izdiyan Muttaqin⁽²⁾

Program Studi Kajian Wilayah Timur Tengah dan Islam, Sekolah Kajian Strategik dan Global,
Universitas Indonesia, Indonesia

Disubmit: 17 Juni 2024; Diproses: 17 Agustus 2024; Diaccept: 30 Agustus 2024; Dipublish: 03 September 2024

*Corresponding author: jefry.anggara@ui.ac.id

Abstrak

Evolusi pemikiran Islam di Indonesia telah dibentuk oleh perubahan sosial, politik, dan ekonomi, dengan tema sentral berupa kritik terhadap liberalisme. Liberalisme, yang menekankan individualisme, kebebasan, dan toleransi, telah meresap ke berbagai aspek masyarakat, termasuk pemahaman agama, struktur sosial, dan kebijakan politik. Di tengah perkembangan ini, tokoh-tokoh berpengaruh seperti Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi muncul sebagai kritikus yang menonjol. Artikel ini meneliti kritik Zarkasyi terhadap liberalisme, menyoroti kekhawatirannya tentang pengurangan nilai-nilai Islam akibat pengaruh eksternal. Dengan menggunakan penelitian kualitatif dalam paradigma interpretatif, studi ini menganalisis tulisan-tulisan Zarkasyi dan sumber-sumber sekunder yang relevan melalui metode deskriptif-analitis. Temuan mengungkapkan argumen Zarkasyi bahwa fokus liberalisme pada kebebasan individu yang mutlak melemahkan tanggung jawab moral dan sosial yang menjadi inti Islam. Dia melihat liberalisme sebagai ancaman potensial terhadap identitas dan nilai-nilai budaya Islam, serta menganjurkan keseimbangan antara hak-hak individu dan prinsip-prinsip etika kolektif. Kontribusi intelektual Zarkasyi menawarkan kerangka kritis untuk menilai dampak liberalisme terhadap pemikiran Islam di Indonesia, memberikan wawasan dalam mempertahankan nilai-nilai Islam yang autentik di tengah pengaruh global.

Kata Kunci: Islamic Worldview; Liberal; Liberalism; Liberalization; Zarkasyi.

Abstract

The evolution of Islamic thought in Indonesia has been shaped by social, political, and economic changes, with a central theme being the critique of liberalism. Liberalism, emphasizing individualism, freedom, and tolerance, has permeated various societal aspects, including religious understanding, social structures, and political policies. Amidst this, influential figures like Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi have emerged as notable critics. This article examines Zarkasyi's critiques of liberalism, highlighting his concerns about the dilution of Islamic values due to external influences. Employing qualitative research within an interpretive paradigm, the study analyzes Zarkasyi's writings and relevant secondary sources through descriptive-analytical methods. Findings reveal Zarkasyi's argument that liberalism's focus on absolute individual freedom undermines moral and social responsibilities central to Islam. He views liberalism as a potential threat to Islamic identity and cultural values, advocating for a balance between individual rights and collective ethical principles. Zarkasyi's intellectual contributions offer a critical framework for assessing liberalism's impact on Islamic thought in Indonesia, providing insights into maintaining authentic Islamic values amidst global influences.

Keywords: Islamic Worldview; Liberal; Liberalism; Liberalization; Zarkasyi.

How to Cite: Anggara, J. & Muttaqin, M. I. (2024). Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi' Critics toward Liberalism. *Islamika Granada*, 5 (1): 1-10.

INTRODUCTION

Islamic thought in Indonesia has undergone significant development in line with the changing social, political and economic dynamics in society. One of the issues that has become the center of attention in the study of Islamic thought is the critique of liberalism, which has become an integral part of intellectual discussions. Liberalism thinking has influenced various aspects of people's lives, including the understanding of religion, social order, and political policies (Amin & Syarifah, 2021).

In Indonesia, the premise of liberalism has penetrated into contemporary Islamic thought. Liberalism has created a new mindset in understanding religious teachings, emphasizing the values of individualism, freedom, and tolerance. However, in the midst of the rapid development of this thought, there are voices of criticism that have emerged, one of which comes from figures such as Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi (Anah, 2021).

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi, an influential Islamic intellectual in Indonesia, has consistently criticized liberalism in Islamic thought. These criticisms are reflected in his various writings such as "Liberalization of Islamic Thought: A Joint Movement of Missionaries, Orientalists and Colonialists" (Zarkasyi, 2009). Zarkasyi's thoughts have sparked debate in an effort to understand the implications of liberalism for Islamic thought and practice in Indonesia.

Zarkasyi's thinking illustrates the diversity of views on liberalism among Islamic thinkers. Some see liberalism as a form of progress in understanding universal values, while others see it as a threat to Islamic identity and values. In this context, Zarkasyi's criticism of liberalism is important in exploring the dynamics of Islamic thought in Indonesia (Fikri, 2020).

One important aspect of Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism is the implications for the development of Islamic thought in Indonesia. Liberalism has an impact on Islamic education, especially in the context of intellectual development among Indonesian Muslim intellectuals. His critique shows the concern of losing the substance of Islamic teachings in the face of globalization (Zarkasyi, 2012).

In the socio-political context, Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism is also relevant. Liberalism has contributed to the transformation of social and political life in Indonesia. However, Zarkasyi warned of the danger of liberalism's influence that could shift the values of justice, solidarity and truth recognized in Islam (Batubara et al., 2021).

The challenges faced by Islamic thought in Indonesia are increasingly complex with the emergence of various new currents of thought. Ulil Abshar Abdallah's thought presents a different perspective on liberalism, but still within the discourse of liberal Islamic thought. In this context, Zarkasyi's critique becomes important as an effort to formulate a stronger alternative in defending Islamic identity and values in Indonesia (Muliyani, 2023).

By digging deeper into Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism, it is hoped that this article can provide a more comprehensive understanding of the dynamics of Islamic thought in Indonesia. Zarkasyi's thought presents an important critical voice in responding to the growing globalization and modernization, as well as strengthening the foundation of Islamic thought that is authentic and relevant in the current context.

The researcher read a journal article entitled "Syed Muhammad Naquib Al-Attas' Critics toward Secularism" (Huringiin, 2022) which discusses the criticism of Al-Attas, a Malaysian scholar, towards secularism. Here I found a gap that has not been researched by his student, Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi, an Indonesian scholar. Secularism and liberalism are thoughts that cannot be separated from Islamic history and civilization, especially in the contemporary era.

According to Hamid fahmy Zarkasyi, there is confusion in the conceptual framework of liberalism. The confusion of thought caused by the entry of civilization factors outside Islam does not occur only in the present, but since the early period of Islamic civilization rose and developed (Zarkasyi, 2009).

Fundamental questions arise. What is Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism in Islamic thought, and its implications in Indonesia? What are the factors that led Zarkasyi to criticize liberalism in Islamic thought in Indonesia? What are the views and responses to Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism among Muslim intellectuals in Indonesia, and how does it impact on Islamic thought in the country? These questions become the starting point for further research in analyzing Zarkasyi's criticism of liberalism in Islamic thought and its implications in Indonesia, exploring the factors that influence Zarkasyi's criticism of liberalism in Islamic thought, and evaluating the views and responses to Zarkasyi's criticism of liberalism among Muslim intellectuals in Indonesia and its impact on Islamic thought in this country.

METHOD

This research is a qualitative research that departs from the interpretive or naturalistic paradigm. Qualitative research as a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of words, records of meaning, values, and understanding (Kaelan, 2010). Researchers try to criticize the idea of liberalism by using Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's views. To achieve this goal, the data obtained through the works of Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi and some secondary data related to Islamic thought including the idea of his Islamic worldview and criticism of liberalism. Researchers used descriptive-analysis in data processing, using a domain analysis model, in an effort to gain an understanding of Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's thoughts.

Domain Analysis Model is essentially a researcher's effort to obtain an overview of the data to answer the research focus. The trick is to read the data text in general and thoroughly to get what domains or domains are in the data. At this stage, researchers do not need to read and understand the data in detail because the target is only to obtain domains or domains. The results of this analysis are still surface-level knowledge about various conceptual domains. The term liberalism is the focal point that is criticized in this research based on the conception built on the Islamic worldview (*Analisis Data Penelitian Kualitatif (Sebuah Pengalaman Empi..., n.d.)*).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Liberalism is an ideology that emphasizes individual freedom, human rights, and a limited role for government in society. One of the main characteristics of liberalism is the

emphasis on individual rights, including the right to hold opinions, practice religion, and conduct economic activities without excessive interference from the government (Sulistiyawan, 2020). This ideology also emphasizes the importance of legal protection of these individual rights (Bahaf, 2015).

The history of liberalism can be traced back to the 17th century, particularly with the emergence of the thought of figures such as John Locke. Locke emphasized the natural rights of individuals, such as the right to life, liberty, and the right to property. (Batubara et al., 2021). This thinking developed into a powerful political movement, especially in Europe and the United States, which eventually influenced the formation of modern democratic states (Filali-Ansary, 2003).

In Indonesia, liberalism has also influenced social and political developments. Although Indonesia has a strong tradition of conservative Islam, liberal thoughts have also emerged and gained a following. (Bourchier & Jusuf, 2023). Some figures such as Ulil Abshar Abdallah became famous for championing liberal ideas in the Islamic context in Indonesia (Mulyani, 2023).

However, the history of liberalism in Indonesia has not always been smooth. There has been resistance from various groups, especially those with conservative views on religion and culture. Islamist movements opposed to liberal thought have also emerged, highlighting the tension between liberalism and traditional values in Indonesia (Samsudin et al., 2020). The debate between liberal and conservative ideologues continues to this day, demonstrating the complexity of thought development in Indonesia (Zarkasyi et al., 2020).

In a global context, the development of liberalism also involves complex dynamics. In some countries, especially in the Middle East, efforts to unite the principles of liberalism with Islamic values have also emerged (Aras, 2004). However, these efforts often face challenges from groups that reject the concept of liberalism as something that is contrary to Islamic teachings (Fajri et al., 2022).

In the realm of Islamic thought, liberalism often encounters significant scrutiny, particularly from figures like Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi, who argue that liberalism threatens Islamic values and societal cohesion. Zarkasyi asserts that liberalism's focus on individual freedom can lead to the marginalization of communal values and responsibilities central to Islam. He highlights that liberalism encourages a separation of religion from public life, which contradicts the Islamic principle of integrating faith with everyday activities (Zarkasyi, 2009).

In contrast, some scholars take a more nuanced view of liberalism. Abdou Filali-Ansary, for example, sees potential in liberal values to foster a more inclusive and enlightened Islamic thought. Filali-Ansary argues that liberalism, when contextualized appropriately, can contribute positively to the development of Muslim societies by promoting critical thinking and individual rights within an Islamic framework (Filali-Ansary, 2003). Similarly, Amin and Syarifah (2021) note the positive influence of liberalism on the development of Quranic exegesis in Indonesia and Malaysia, suggesting that liberal interpretations can enrich Islamic scholarship by encouraging diverse perspectives.

However, critiques of liberalism are also robust from various quarters. Paul Cliteur examines the tension between liberal values and Islamic practices from a feminist perspective, highlighting conflicts that arise when liberal principles are perceived to undermine traditional Islamic norms regarding gender roles (Cliteur, 2011). Furthermore, Zulaiha, Putra, and Gani (2021) review critical views on liberal tafsir (interpretation) in Indonesia, pointing out that such approaches are often seen as disregarding classical and traditional understandings of the Quran.

Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism extends to its impact on Islamic education and intellectual thought in Indonesia. He contends that the liberalization of Islamic education can lead to a dilution of authentic Islamic teachings and values, which are crucial for maintaining the integrity of the faith (Zarkasyi, 2012). This concern is echoed by Fadil, who critiques the shift away from Islamic economic principles due to liberal influences, arguing that such a shift undermines the ethical foundations of Islamic economics (Fadilah, 2022).

Liberalism is an ideology that emphasizes individual freedom and the limited role of government in people's lives. The history and development of liberalism, both in Indonesia and globally, shows its complexity and challenges in facing resistance from various groups. Nonetheless, liberalism remains an important force in shaping the development of modern society.

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi was born in Gontor, September 13, 1958, is the ninth son of KH Imam Zarkasyi, the founder of the Modern Islamic Boarding School Gontor Ponorogo. He is also Editor-in-Chief of ISLAMIA Magazine and director of the Institute for the Study of Islamic Thought and Civilization (INSISTS). He graduated from the Ph.D. program of the International Institute of Islamic Thought and Civilization - International Islamic University Malaysia (ISTAC-IIUM) Malaysia on 6 Ramadhan 1427 H/29 September 2006, successfully defending his dissertation entitled '*Al-Ghazali's Concept of Causality*' in front of examiners namely Prof. Dr. Osman Bakar, Prof. Ir. Prof. Dr. Osman Bakar, Prof. Dr. Ibrahim Zein, Prof. Dr. Torlah, and Prof. Dr. Alparslan Acikgence, an external examiner from Turkey, who praised Hamid's study of al-Ghazali's theory of causality in the study of the history of Islamic thought. This is because Hamid's approach to al-Ghazali's concept of causality has explained something that has been missed by most of al-Ghazali's scholars ("Profil Pendiri", 2015).

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi is a Muslim intellectual who has had a significant influence on the world of Islamic thought in Indonesia. As a prominent academic, Zarkasyi has contributed his thoughts in various fields, including the relationship between Islam and liberalism. In his article entitled "Genealogy of the Liberalization of Islamic Thought," Zarkasyi discusses the history and development of liberal thought in Islam, outlining its impacts and highlighting the complexity of this movement (Fahmy, 2009). In the context of Islamic education in Indonesia, Zarkasyi examines the influence of liberalism and liberalization on Islamic education, highlighting the challenges and implications faced by Indonesian Muslim intellectuals (Zarkasyi, 2012). Zarkasyi's contribution to understanding the dynamics of liberal Islamic thought is important in developing a more

comprehensive understanding of this branch of thought in Indonesia (Amin & Syarifah, 2021).

In addition, Zarkasyi is also known for his critique of Western capitalism and his attempts to understand the relationship between Islam and economics. In his article entitled "The Worldview of Islam and Western Capitalism," Zarkasyi outlines his views on the conflict between Islamic values and the logic of Western capitalism, highlighting the fundamental differences between the two paradigms (Zarkasyi, 2013). In this context, Zarkasyi's thinking enriches the understanding of the relationship between religion and economics and offers relevant insights for Indonesian Muslims in facing contemporary economic challenges (Fadilah, 2022).

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's contribution to the world of Islamic thought in Indonesia covers various aspects, from analyzing liberal thought in Islam to criticizing Western capitalism. Through his works, Zarkasyi has made valuable contributions to the understanding and development of Islamic thought that is inclusive, adaptive and relevant to the current Indonesian context.

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi has expressed deep criticism of liberalism, especially in the context of Islamic thought. One of his critical arguments is that liberalism has basic assumptions that contradict conservative Islamic values. Zarkasyi highlights that liberalism tends to prioritize absolute individual freedom, without considering the balance between freedom and social responsibility in Islamic society. He argues that a liberal view of individual rights can ignore the moral and ethical principles enjoined by Islam, as stated in the Qur'an and hadith (Zarkasyi, 2009).

Zarkasyi also points out that liberalism can have a negative impact on Islamic cultural identity and values. In his mind, liberalism is often regarded as a tool of Western cultural colonization that threatens the sovereignty of traditional Islamic thought and values. He emphasizes that the acceptance of liberal values can blur the lines between right and wrong according to Islamic teachings, resulting in a reduction of the substance and authenticity of the religion itself (Zarkasyi, 2013).

The methodological approach used by Zarkasyi in criticizing liberalism is through philosophical studies and a deep understanding of Islamic values. He critically examines the foundations of liberal thought, compares them with Islamic teachings, and highlights the incongruities between the two paradigms. This approach reflects Zarkasyi's attempt to build a strong and detailed argument through a comprehensive analysis of the assumptions and implications of liberalism's views (Zarkasyi, 2012).

As such, Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's critique of liberalism reflects a deeply critical approach to the opposition between Islamic values and liberal principles. Through careful philosophical and methodological analysis, Zarkasyi makes a valuable contribution to debating the relationship between Islam and liberalism in the context of Indonesian thought (Zarkasyi, 2013).

In Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's thinking, liberalism is often seen as a threat to Islamic values and Muslim society. Zarkasyi highlights that liberalism tends to lead to the separation of religion from public life, which is contrary to Islamic principles that govern

various aspects of life. He emphasizes that liberalism promotes excessive individualism and ignores the values of collectivity and solidarity in Islamic society (Zarkasyi, 2009).

In comparison, other figures such as Abdou Filali-Ansary take a more inclusive approach to liberalism in Islam. Filali-Ansary identifies the potential to build a more open and inclusive Islamic thought by utilizing the values of liberalism in a context that is compatible with the Islamic tradition. Abdou Filali-Ansary describes liberalism as one of the sources of enlightened Muslim thought (Filali-Ansary, 2003). Likewise, Ahmad Syaifuddin Amin and Maisyatusy Syarifah, who highlighted the positive influence of liberalism in the development of Qur'anic interpretation in Indonesia and Malaysia, recognized that liberalism can make a positive contribution to Islamic thought (Amin & Syarifah, 2021).

However, critiques of liberalism also come from various perspectives. Paul Cliteur, for example, discusses the critique of Islamism from a feminist perspective and highlights the conflict between liberal values and practices that are considered detrimental to women in Islamic societies (Cliteur, 2011). In addition, Eni Zulaiha, Restu Ashari Putra, and Rizal Abdul Gani review critical views on liberal tafsir in Indonesia, highlighting that this approach is often perceived as ignoring classical and traditional aspects of Qur'anic understanding (Zulaiha et al., 2021).

In his analysis, Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi also highlights that liberalism has had a significant impact on Islamic education and intellectual thought in Indonesia. He notes that liberalization in Islamic thought and education often negatively impacts the authentic understanding of Islam and distorts the fundamental values of the religion (Zarkasyi, 2012). A similar critique was also raised by Muhammad Fadil, who highlighted that liberalization can lead to a shift away from authentic Islamic economic principles (Fadilah, 2022).

A comparison of Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's views with those of other figures on liberalism shows differences in approach and assessment of this phenomenon. While some support the positive potential of liberalism in an Islamic context, Zarkasyi and some other critics highlight its negative impact on traditional Islamic values and Muslim society. In this context, it is important to pay attention to these diverse debates in order to understand the diversity of views in trying to deal with the challenges of liberalism in an Islamic context.

The Islamic worldview, as understood by Zarkasyi, has a significant role in responding to the challenges of liberalism. Islam as a holistic religion offers a worldview that includes spiritual, social and political aspects. In this perspective, liberalism is seen as an ideology that contradicts Islamic values because it places individual freedom above adherence to religious teachings (Zarkasyi, 2009). Zarkasyi argues that liberalism is based on Western capitalism that has created social inequality and exploitation of the weak (Zarkasyi, 2013).

Islam as a solution to liberalism is defined as an attempt to refocus society on moral and spiritual values derived from religious teachings. Zarkasyi emphasizes the importance of instilling a strong understanding of Islamic teachings in society in order to overcome the influence of liberal ideologies that often lead to moral decadence and social decay

(Zarkasyi, 2009). In this context, the concept of wasathiyah (moderate) Islam becomes important as a foundation for building a society that is balanced between individual freedom and adherence to religious values (Dermawan & Nursikin, 2024).

In response to liberalism, Islam also offers alternatives in concepts such as ta'dib (moral education) and adab (ethics). Husni explains that ta'dib in the thought of al-Attas, a leading Islamic thinker, emphasizes the importance of internalizing Islamic moral values in daily life. This creates a solid foundation for society to resist the temptation of liberalism that ignores or even destroys ethical and moral values (Husni, 2023).

In the context of Islamic thought, liberal approaches to religion are often perceived as a threat to religious authority and true Islamic identity. Shafie & Wahab criticize the liberal approach to Islam as being contrary to the manhaj (methodology) of Ahli Sunnah wal Jama'ah. They emphasize the importance of understanding Islamic teachings comprehensively and preserving the sanctity of religious teachings from corrupting influences (Shafie & Wahab, 2022).

In the face of liberalism, Islam also offers insights into social and economic justice that include the principles of wealth redistribution and the protection of the weak. Islam is different from liberalism in its understanding of wealth distribution and social responsibility. In Islam, wealth is seen as a trust that must be managed fairly and used for the welfare of all (Fajri et al., 2022).

In the Indonesian context, Islam is also seen as a counterweight to the influence of liberalism that is increasingly entering into various aspects of life. Islamic societies in Indonesia have great potential to maintain traditional values and religious morality in the face of liberalism coming from outside. By strengthening a strong Islamic identity, Indonesian society can maintain the sovereignty of religious values in the face of the challenges of liberalism (Anah, 2021).

It appears that Islam can serve as a solution to liberalism by offering a holistic worldview, strengthening moral and spiritual values, promoting concepts such as ta'dib and adab, maintaining the authority and identity of true Islam, and advocating for social and economic justice. Thus, Islamic insights can serve as a strong foundation in resisting the tide of liberalism, which is often considered to be against religious values and social morality.

CONCLUSION

Zarkasyi, a prominent Muslim intellectual, articulated a comprehensive critique of liberalism, stating that liberalism is contrary to Islamic values and poses a threat to the cultural and religious identity of Muslims in Indonesia. Through qualitative research, this article explores Zarkasyi's concerns about the impact of liberal ideology on the development of Islamic thought and the socio-political landscape in Indonesia.

Zarkasyi's critique centers on liberalism's emphasis on individual freedom and the limited role of government, which he argues can lead to moral and social disintegration. He argues that the conceptual ambiguities of liberalism and its global spread require a strong Islamic response that upholds moral and spiritual values, advocates for social and economic justice, and defends Islamic identity against the tide of globalization.

Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi's critical engagement with liberalism is a significant contribution to Islamic thought in Indonesia. His work calls for a re-evaluation of liberal principles in relation to Islamic teachings and emphasizes the need for a balanced approach that preserves Islamic values while engaging with the modern world.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Amin, A. S., & Syarifah, M. S. (2021). Liberal Islam and Its Influences on The Development of Quranic Exegesis in Indonesia and Malaysia. *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis*, 22(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.14421/qh.2021.2201-07>
- Anah, S. (2021). Masyarakat Islam Indonesia pada Abad Modern dan Kontemporer. *Jurnal Keislaman*, 4(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.54298/jk.v4i2.3332>
- Analisis Data Penelitian Kualitatif (Sebuah Pengalaman Empi... (n.d.). Uin-Malang.Ac.Id. Retrieved May 7, 2024, from <https://uin-malang.ac.id/blog/post/read/100601/analisis-data-penelitian-kualitatif-sebuah-pengalaman-empirik.html>
- Aras, B. (2004). The future of liberal Islam. *Futures : The Journal of Policy, Planning and Futures Studies*, 36(9), 1034–1037. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.futures.2004.02.001>
- Bahaf, M. A. (2015). *Islam Liberal Indonesia: Sejarah dan Konsepsi*. Penerbit A-Empat.
- Batubara, U. N., Siregar, R., & Siregar, N. (2021). Liberalisme John Locke dan Pengaruhnya dalam Tatanan Kehidupan. *Jurnal Education and Development*, 9(4), 485–491. <https://doi.org/10.37081/ed.v9i4.3189>
- Bourchier, D., & Jusuf, W. (2023). Liberalism in Indonesia: Between Authoritarian Statism and Islamism. *Asian Studies Review*, 47(1), 69–87. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2022.2125932>
- Cliteur, P. (2011). Female Critics of Islamism: Liberal or Secular Islam? *Feminist Theology*, 19(2), 154–167. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0966735010384328>
- Dermawan, Y. A., & Nursikin, M. (2024). Tantangan Islam Wasathiyah di Nusantara. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 8(1), 7563–7569. <https://doi.org/10.31004/jptam.v8i1.13536>
- Fadilah, N. (2022). Liberalisasi dan Permasalahan Ekonomi: Sebuah Kritik Implementasi Ekonomi Islam terhadap Ekonomi Pasar Bebas. *Salimiya: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Keagamaan Islam*, 3(2), Article 2.
- Fahmy, H. (2009). Genealogi Liberalisasi Pemikiran Islam. *Ulumuna*, 13(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v13i1.374>
- Fajri, M. R., Radiansyah, R., & Putra, A. B. (2022). Islam vs Liberalisme: Konstruksi Pemikiran Binder dan Kurzman. *Al Mabhats : Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Agama*, 7(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.47766/almabhats.v7i1.1017>
- Fikri, R. (2020). Liberalisme dalam Islam menurut tafsir Maudhu'i (tematik). *Journal of Quran Education and Teaching*, 1(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jqt.v1i1.191>
- Filali-Ansary, A. (2003). What Is Liberal Islam? The Sources of Enlightened Muslim Thought. *Journal of Democracy*, 14(2), 19–33. <https://doi.org/10.1353/jod.2003.0031>
- Huringiin, N. (2022). Syed Muhammad Naquib Al-Attas' Critics toward Secularism. *Akademika : Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 27(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.32332/akademika.v27i1.4801>
- Husni, R. (2023). Konsep Ta'dib Menurut Al-Attas dan Kaitannya dengan Dewesternisasi dan Islamisasi Ilmu. *Fikrah : Journal of Islamic Education*, 7(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.32507/fikrah.v7i2.2219>
- Kaelan. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Agama Kualitatif Interdisipliner*. Paradigma.
- Muliyani, S. (2023). Liberalisme di Indonesia dalam Pemikiran Ulil Abshar Abdallah. *Ulil Albab : Jurnal Ilmiah Multidisiplin*, 3(1), 402–408. <https://doi.org/10.56799/jim.v3i1.2623>
- Profil Pendiri. (2015, December 22). *INSISTS*. <https://insists.id/profil-peneliti/>
- Samsudin, S., Zakaria, M. M., & Mahzuni, D. (2020). Peran Ormas Islam dalam Menolak Islam Liberal (Sejarah dan Peran Fuui dalam Menolak Islam Liberal Bandung 2000-2003). *Al-Tsaqafa : Jurnal Ilmiah Peradaban Islam*, 17(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.15575/al-tsaqafa.v17i1.9034>
- Shafie, A. B., & Wahab, M. R. (2022). [The Liberal Approach to Islam and Its Contractions with The Sunni] Pendekatan Liberal terhadap Islam dan Percanggahannya dengan Manhaj Ahli Sunah Waljamaah. *Jurnal Islam Dan Masyarakat Kontemporer*, 23(1), 172–184. <https://doi.org/10.37231/jimk.2022.23.1.659>
- Sulistiyawan, A. Y. (2020). Liberalisme dan Rasionalitas sebagai Basis Rule of Law: Perspektif Gerald Turkel. *Undang: Jurnal Hukum*, 3(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.22437/ujh.3.1.173-200>
- Zarkasyi, H. F. (2009). Liberalisasi Pemikiran Islam: Gerakan Bersama Missionaris, Orientalis dan Kolonialis. *TSQAFAH*, 5(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.21111/tsaqafah.v5i1.145>

- Zarkasyi, H. F. (2012). Liberalism, Liberalization and Their Impacts of Muslim Education (Special Case of Indonesian Intellectuals). *Tsaqafah*, 8(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.21111/tsaqafah.v8i1.23>
- Zarkasyi, H. F. (2013). Worldview Islam dan Kapitalisme Barat. *Tsaqafah*, 9(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.21111/tsaqafah.v9i1.36>
- Zarkasyi, H. F., Arroisi, J., Taqiyuddin, M., & Syam'un 'Salim, M. (2020). Islamisasi Ilmu Komunikasi: Telaah atas Karya Mohd Yusof Hussain. *Prosiding Konferensi Integrasi Interkoneksi Islam Dan Sains*, 2, 185-193.
- Zulaiha, E., Putra, R. A., & Gani, R. A. (2021). Selayang Pandang Tafsir Liberal di Indonesia. *Jurnal Iman Dan Spiritualitas*, 1(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jis.vii2.11700>